

EVALUATION REPORT

Request for Proposals for the Installation and Operation of Electric Vehicle Charging Stations within the Borough of Tenafly, County of Bergen, State of New Jersey

Prepared for: Borough of Tenafly

By: Borough of Tenafly Evaluation Team

Dated: April 16, 2023

Evaluation Report Table of Contents

<u>Report Sections</u>	<u>Page</u>
Executive Summary	2
1. Summary of Benefits	4
2. Overview of the RFP	4
3. Form of Proposals and Required Forms	6
4. Evaluation Process	7
5. Proposals in Response to RFP	7
6. Proposal Evaluation Matrix	8
7. Recommendation – Successful Respondent	10
<u>Attachments</u>	
Evaluation Matrix	Att. 1

Executive Summary

This Evaluation Report is being provided pursuant to and in accordance with the requirements of the competitive contracting provisions of the Local Public Contracts Law (N.J.S.A. 40A:11-4.1 et seq.). The purpose of this Evaluation Report is to provide the Council of the Borough of Tenafly ("Borough") with an evaluation of the proposals received in response to a Request for Proposals issued by the Borough, and to provide a recommendation to the Borough Council of a Respondent for the award of a contract (the "Successful Respondent").

The Borough is dedicated to improving regional air quality, reducing petroleum usage, mitigating greenhouse gas emissions, and improving the lives of its residents by offering affordable and state-of-the-art transportation options through the development of innovative technologies. Recognizing the critical role of local governments in the development of alternative-fuel infrastructure, the Borough is acting as a catalyst for market transformation, leading by example in its own operations and encouraging the private sector to bring about significant and sustainable use of alternative fuels and advanced vehicle technologies.

The goal of the Borough in utilizing the competitive contracting process is to obtain proposals from qualified respondents for the provision of concession services for the installation and operation of electric vehicle charging stations within the Borough. More specifically, the Borough of Tenafly is seeking a qualified firm to design, furnish, install, operate, and maintain a minimum of four (4) publicly accessible electric vehicle ("EV") charging stations, Level II or higher, on Borough-owned property through a turnkey solution in accordance with the terms, conditions, and specifications as described in the RFP "Services". The proposed term of the Contract for the Services is for five years.

On December 16, 2022, the Borough issued a Request for Proposals ("RFP") to solicit Proposals for the provision of these concession Services, as more particularly described herein, pursuant the competitive contracting provisions of the Local Public Contracts Law, N.J.S.A. 40A:11-1 et seq, and authorized by Resolution #R22-88 adopted on March 8, 2022. Through this competitive contracting process, the Borough seeks to enter into a contract with a qualified firm to implement a self-sufficient, reliable, independently operated system requiring no Borough capital or operating expenses.

Services are expected to be performed in compliance with all federal, state, and local requirements, laws, rules and regulations, and in accordance with the terms and provisions of the Contract, the terms and provisions of the RFP and in accordance with prudent industry practice. The Borough anticipates cooperating in good faith with the Successful Respondent to facilitate the performance of the obligations set forth in the RFP.

To evaluate Proposals, the Borough organized an evaluation team comprised of Jimmy Homs, Borough Administrator, Council Person Dan Park, Council Person Dr. Julie O'Connor, and Borough Attorney Wendy Rubinstein Quiroga Esq., of the Weiner Law Group, LLP (collectively, the "Evaluation Team").

The procurement and evaluation process were undertaken in accordance with the competitive contracting provisions of the Local Public Contracts Law, and all other applicable law. On January 25, 2023, the Borough opened one (1) Proposal in response to the RFP. The Proposal was submitted by Greenspot JC, LLC, 155 2nd Street, Jersey City, New Jersey.

The Evaluation Team conducted a comprehensive evaluation of the Proposal based upon qualifications, experience, reasonableness of the claims and/or commitments made, the completeness of the data provided, the innovation and reliability of the approach taken, the ability of the Respondent to perform the Services, and conformance with the requirements of the RFP, as set forth in detail in this Evaluation Report, in accordance with competitive contracting provisions of the Local Public Contracts Law and other applicable law. The evaluation of the Proposal was conducted in accordance with an evaluation matrix ("Evaluation Matrix"), that is based on a total potential score of 100. The following criteria and weighting factors were utilized:

Item	Maximum Points	Comments
A. General Qualifications		
1. Assigned Personnel and Staff Qualifications	10	Should demonstrate relevant experience with EV infrastructure, installation and operation
B. Administrative/Management		
1. Prior Experience with turnkey, concession projects	10	Should demonstrate experience providing turnkey solutions and products
2. Experience with NJ Government	10	Should demonstrate familiarity working with NJ local or state entities
C. Technical Criteria		
1. Planning	5	Ability to provide quality concept plan
2. Design and Material Quality	15	Number and types of stations proposed
3. Maintenance	10	Plan for maintaining charging stations
4. Customer Service	5	Quality of customer service/staffing
5. Implementation Schedule	10	Provide implementation plan and ability to expedite schedule

6. Warranty and support services	5	Demonstrate plan for warranty and support services
D. Financial/Performance Service Criteria	10	Ability to financially sustain system
E. Cost proposal	10	Should provide proposal of potential costs to end users and any potential revenue proposal to Borough
Total	100	

Based on the information and analysis set forth in this Report, the Evaluation Team recommends the Borough Council award the contract with the Borough for the Installation and Operation of Electric Vehicle Charging Stations to Greenspot JC, LLC.

Summary of Benefits

As noted above, the objective of the Borough’s RFP is to enter into a five (5) year contract with a qualified respondent for the provision of concession services for the installation and operation of electric vehicle charging stations within the Borough.

The Proposal received by the Borough from Greenspot JC, LLC will allow the Borough to participate in improving regional air quality, reducing petroleum usage, mitigating greenhouse gas emissions, and improving the lives of its residents by offering alternative-fuel infrastructure.

Overview of the RFP

The RFP solicited Proposals for the performance of Electric Vehicle Charging Station concession services including the design, furnishing, installation and operation of a minimum of four (4) publicly accessible electric vehicle charging stations, Level II or higher, on Borough-owned property through a turnkey solution (“Services”) pursuant to a Contract to be entered into by and between the Borough and the Successful Respondent. The RFP provided that the Successful Respondent will have expertise in providing turnkey program to install, operate and maintain electric vehicle charging stations. The Successful Respondent is responsible for:

- Developing (with the Borough) the strategy for locating charging stations to maximize utilization.
- Developing and implementing the business model, including the back-end functionality.
- Providing warranty and service for the charging stations and infrastructure for the term of the Agreement.

-
-
- Purchasing and installing charging stations and associated infrastructure supporting the Project.

The RFP noted that the equipment be installed and readied for use by the Successful Respondent, inclusive of any required utility connections/ communication/ etc; and the equipment should be maintained by the Successful Respondent.

More specifically, the scope of work includes the following components:

Infrastructure:

The Successful Respondent will develop infrastructure and install a minimum of four (4) EV vehicle charging stations, Level II or higher, and will be responsible for the following:

- Site survey;
- Design and preparation of plans and specifications for each of the proposed locations per Borough standards;
- Obtaining municipal permits for EV charging station electric work;
- Obtaining dedicated electric service for EV charging stations;
- Civil activities (Concrete, Asphalt, Trenching, Underground Enclosures);
- Demolition (Concrete, Asphalt);
- Coordination with all applicable agencies to obtain necessary permits;
- Electric Work – full turnkey electric work, including but not limited to running electrical conduit and circuitry between electrical destination set-up and the EV chargers;
- Compliance with National Electric Code and FCC Regulations for safety and operation requirements;
- Coordination with Borough to ensure all facilities are successfully registered with CARB under the Low Carbon Fuel Standard Program;
- Securing and complying with Borough encroachment and building permits;
- Installation of signage, pavement markings, lighting, and restoration of existing conditions;
- Testing and commissioning of the EV charging stations;
- Compliance with Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA); and
- Installation of the EV chargers.

Operation and Maintenance:

- Charging station maintenance;

-
-
- Charging station general upkeep;
 - Charging station improvements, at discretion of Successful Respondent, subject to Borough approval;
 - Insurance of the charging stations and related equipment;
 - Providing timely maintenance services and 24/7 customer support; and
 - Enabling and processing point of sale transactions while providing flexible payment options that allow for universal public access.

Regulatory Considerations:

Any charging stations and associated infrastructure developed by the Successful Respondent will comply with the appropriate state and local government laws, rules, regulations, and policies. The Successful Respondent will also be responsible for applying for and obtaining applicable certifications, licenses, and permits necessary for the installation and operation of charging stations and associated infrastructure. The Borough is committed to its role in supporting the initial deployment of charging infrastructure and will work with the Successful Respondent to resolve any regulatory hurdles that may arise.

The RFP also provides that the Successful Respondent and the Borough will enter into a Contract for five (5) years. Pursuant to the terms of the RFP, the Successful Respondent must be prepared to execute and deliver to the Borough a form of agreement acceptable to the Borough, in its sole discretion, within ten (10) days of its presentation. Moreover, subcontracting and/or assignment of any portion of the Services to be provided un the terms of the RPP are strictly prohibited without prior written consent of the Borough, in its sole discretion.

Form of Proposals and Required Forms

Proposals were required to include the following information about each Respondent:

- General Information
- Administrative Information
- Professional Information, including experience and qualifications

Proposals were also required to include the following:

- Letter of Qualification
- Affirmative Action Compliance
- Letter of Intent
- Ownership Disclosure Statement
- Contribution Statement

-
- Non-Collusion Affidavit
 - Acknowledgement of Receipt of Addenda
 - Mandatory EEO Language
 - Disclosure of Investment Activities in Iran
 - Fee Proposal
 - Executive Summary
 - All Additional Administrative/Professional Information
 - Proposal Checklist

Evaluation Process

To evaluate the Proposals, the Borough organized the Evaluation Team and developed an Evaluation Matrix prior to the issuance of the RFP. The evaluation of the Proposals involved a three-part process:

- The first part consisted of a review of the documents submitted with the Proposal to determine if the Respondent included all documentation and information in its Proposal required by the RFP. Once all submittal requirements have been satisfied, a Respondent qualifies for the second phase of the evaluation process.
- The second part of the process included an interview with a representative from the Respondent.
- The third part entailed a weighted rating of the value provided by the Proposal across several categories (ability to meet objectives, technical criteria, Respondent experience with representation of governmental entities, Respondent familiarity with the turnkey concession services, general experience and qualifications, and cost) and evaluation of factors within those categories as set forth in the evaluation criteria.

The conforming Respondent with the top ranking in the third part of the evaluation process is then recommended for award of a contract as the Successful Respondent.

Proposal in Response to the RFP

The following is a summary of the Proposal from the Respondent:

1. Greenspot JC, LLC (“Greenspot”)

Greenspot was founded in 2014 and is headquartered in Jersey City, New Jersey. Its mission is to create long-term mobility solutions by developing electric vehicle charging infrastructure, delivering reliable charging network and best-in-class

service nationwide. Greenspot’s network spans more than 150 Level 2 and Level 3 DC chargers serving over 6,000 customers in 20+ markets across 9 states. As a charging network owner-operator, Greenspot is positioned to provide reliable and consistent experience for electric vehicle drivers. Greenspot works with municipalities to develop strategies to maximize the utilization of electric vehicle supply equipment and its technical operations team and site development team have the requisite knowledge and experience to provide the concession services requested in the RFP.

The proposed Greenspot team assembled to provide the electric vehicle charging installation and operation concession services to the Borough is led by Joseph Desimone. Mr. Desimone, Greenspot’s Chief Operating Officer since 2021, manages the company’s municipal projects. Some of Greenspot’s representative municipal clients include Jersey City, Asbury Park, Newport, Mount Olive, Long Branch, and Bradley Beach.

Greenspot’s business model is to invest in EV charging infrastructure and slowly return the investment over time through utilization. Through this model, Greenspot proposes to meet the objectives described in the RFP by providing an end-to-end solution that requires no upfront capital or ongoing operating expenses. Greenspot owns the EV chargers and will cover the cost of and complete the installation, operation, and maintenance of the EV charging infrastructure. Greenspot covers the cost of the electricity and as an additional benefit to the Borough, Greenspot will share 10% of their operating margin with the Borough.

In providing the Services to the Borough, Greenspot’s proposal begins with the selection of initial locations for EV stations and will make recommendations based on the desire to maximize utilization. Once site selections are approved by the Borough, Greenspot will complete design and engineering for each location and submit for Borough approval. Once approved, Greenspot will obtain permits and complete construction. After installation, Greenspot begins to operate with 24/7 system monitoring and customer support. As time goes on, Greenspot will continue to make recommendations for upgrades and/or expansions.

Proposal Evaluation Matrix

Proposals are evaluated in accordance with the process defined in the RFP. The evaluation was conducted pursuant to the Evaluation Matrix, which is based on a total potential score of 100. The Evaluation Matrix is broken into the following criteria and weighting factors

1. General Qualifications (10%)
2. Administrative/Management (20%)

-
-
3. Technical Criteria (50%)
 4. Financial/Performance Service Criteria. (10%)
 5. Cost proposal. (10%)

The Evaluation Matrix scoring is provided in **Attachment 1**. The following sections of this Evaluation Report provide a review of the evaluation criteria with respect to the Proposals received.

1. General Qualifications, assigned staffing and personnel qualification

Greenspot demonstrated that they clearly understood the Borough's goals and objectives regarding the provision of Electric Vehicle Charging Station concession services including the design, furnishing, installation and operation of a minimum of four (4) publicly accessible electric vehicle charging stations, Level II or higher, on Borough-owned property through a turnkey solution. The Proposal met the minimum standards and substantially addressed the requirements of the RFP, including that Respondent's personnel possessed the necessary experience in performing Services like those sought by the Borough.

2. Administrative/Management – Prior experience with turnkey concession projects and experience with NJ government.

The Respondent provided substantial examples of experience providing turnkey EV concession projects on behalf of governmental entities in NJ. In fact, Greenspot is providing the same services requested in this RFP in multiple municipalities within this State as well as providing such services in nine states.

3. Technical Criteria: planning; design and material quality; maintenance; customer service; implementation schedule, warranty and support.

Greenspot provided specifications and examples of the proposed equipment and suggested locations for the charging stations. Greenspot uses plug in play type of equipment which makes it easier and more efficient to maintain and upgrade.

Additionally, Greenspot's business model incentivizes the Respondent to maintain its hardware and customer service since its profitability is limited by usage. As such, the Respondent also proposes an aggressive construction and implementation schedule in order to get the network up and running as soon as possible.

4. Financial performance

Greenspot will not be funding the project utilizing debt or revenue. Greenspot builds through equity. Greenspot is financially backed by a larger real estate developer and management company named the Shuster Group that has been in business for over 25 years. Greenspot also provided attestation from their financial institution as to this financial backing and stability to provide the requirements of the RFP.

E. Cost Proposal

Greenspot proposes to provide the requisite services at no cost to the Borough, and further proposes to share 10% of their operating margin with the Borough.

Recommendation – Successful Respondent

In recommending that a Contract be awarded to Greenspot as the Successful Respondent, the Evaluation Team reviewed the Proposal for legal compliance, as well as technical, experience, qualifications, knowledge, and fee structure requirements set forth by the RFP.

Greenspot's Proposal averaged 99.25 points out of a possible 100 points on the Evaluation Matrix. The Evaluation Team believes that Greenspot has assembled a quality project team with the experience and technical capability, and knowledge and wherewithal to work as a partner with the Borough to efficiently and effectively provide the Scope of Work for Installation and Operation of Electric Vehicle Charging Concession Services sought under the RFP.

Accordingly, the Evaluation Team recommends that the Borough Council of the Borough of Tenafly award a contract to Greenspot for the performance of the Services.

Attachment 1 - Proposal Evaluation Matrix

Evaluation Matrix Evaluation Team Scoring							
Evaluation Criteria		Maximum Points	Scoring by Evaluation Team for Respondent Greenspot JC, LLC				AVERAGE TOTAL
			Reviewer #1	Reviewer #2	Reviewer #3	Reviewer #4	
A. General Qualifications							
	1. Assigned Personnel and Staff Qualifications	10	10	10	10	9	9.75
B. Administrative/Management							
	1. Prior Experience with turnkey, concession projects	10	10	10	10	10	10
	2. Experience with NJ Government	10	10	10	10	9	9.75
C. Technical Criteria							
	1. Planning	5	5	5	5	5	5
	2. Design and Material Quality	15	15	15	15	15	15
	3. Maintenance	10	10	10	10	10	10
	4. Customer Service	5	5	5	5	5	5
	5. Implementation Schedule	10	9	10	10	10	9.75
	6. Warranty and Support Service	5	5	5	5	5	5
D. Financial/Performance Criteria		10	10	10	10	10	10
E. Cost Proposal		10	10	10	10	10	10
						Total	99.25